

# **International Criminal Justice Series**

Volume 36

## **Series Editors**

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Moritz Vormbaum, Münster, Germany

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications covering the entire field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Moritz Vormbaum  
University of Münster  
Faculty of Law  
Bispinghof 24–25  
48143 Münster, Germany  
[vormbaum@uni-muenster.de](mailto:vormbaum@uni-muenster.de)

Dimitrios A. Kourtis

# Genocide and the Right to Exist

An International Criminal Law Account



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Dimitrios A. Kourtis  
Faculty of Law, International Studies  
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki  
Thessaloniki, Greece

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)  
International Criminal Justice Series  
ISBN 978-94-6265-658-1 ISBN 978-94-6265-659-8 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-659-8>

This work was supported by Hellenic Foundation for Research and Innovation.

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author(s) 2024

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands [www.asserpress.nl](http://www.asserpress.nl)  
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg  
No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.  
The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE, part of Springer Nature.  
The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	1
1.1	Introductory Remarks	1
1.2	Main Premise	5
1.3	Current Doctrine	6
1.4	Methodology	8
1.5	Terminology	11
1.6	Structure	12
	References	13
<b>2</b>	<b>Group Rights and the Right to Exist</b>	19
2.1	Abstract Entities and International Legal Discourse	19
2.2	Semantics in the Group Rights Discourse	21
2.3	Groups <i>qua</i> Right-Holders	25
2.4	Critique Against Group Rights	33
2.5	Different Approaches to Group Rights	37
2.5.1	Hannah Arendt and the Right to Have Rights	37
2.5.2	Will and Benefit Theory (Hart)	39
2.5.3	‘Jural Opposites’ and ‘Jural Correlatives’ (Hohfeld)	41
2.5.4	Interest Theory (Raz)	45
2.5.5	Value Collectivism	48
2.5.6	Nominalism (May)	51
2.6	A Collective Right to Exist	52
	References	54
<b>3</b>	<b>Understanding the Collective Right to Exist: Acoustic Separation and Survival Units</b>	65
3.1	Genocide and Third-Party Beneficiaries(?)	65
3.2	Genocide and the Question of Right(s)	69

- 3.3 Acoustic Separation ..... 80
  - 3.3.1 Acoustic Separation in the Law on Genocide ..... 83
  - 3.3.2 Early Proponents of the Convention ..... 85
  - 3.3.3 Early Opponents of the Convention ..... 91
- 3.4 The Law on Genocide and its Conduct/Decision Rules ..... 106
  - 3.4.1 Destruction and the Question of *Physis* ..... 112
  - 3.4.2 Genocide in the Nuremberg Trial ..... 117
  - 3.4.3 *Excursus*: Genocide and the Survival Unit ..... 121
  - 3.4.4 Genocide in the Subsequent Nuremberg Proceedings ..... 129
  - 3.4.5 Genocide in the Early Postwar National Jurisprudence ..... 141
- References ..... 151
- 4 Grouphood in the Law on Genocide ..... 167**
  - 4.1 Introductory Remarks ..... 167
  - 4.2 International Jurisprudence: Circumventing the Definitional Question ..... 169
  - 4.3 Grouphood in the Drafting Process: Apolitical and Inescapable ..... 174
  - 4.4 Revisionist Attempts ..... 189
  - 4.5 Involuntary Groups ..... 195
  - 4.6 Grouphood in *Akayesu* and the Need for a Contextual Reading ..... 204
    - 4.6.1 The Legal Actors in *Akayesu* ..... 206
    - 4.6.2 The Expert Witness and the Court ..... 211
    - 4.6.3 Defining ‘Tutsiness’ as a Common Project ..... 215
    - 4.6.4 Grouphood in *Akayesu* as a Subjective Concept ..... 223
  - References ..... 248
- 5 The Protected Value and the Prohibition of Genocide ..... 271**
  - 5.1 A Trans-subjective Dialectical Interpretation of the Protected Value ..... 271
  - 5.2 A National, Ethnical, Racial, or Religious Group ..... 286
    - 5.2.1 National and Ethnic(al) Groups ..... 287
    - 5.2.2 Ethnic(al) and Racial Groups ..... 303
    - 5.2.3 Religious Groups ..... 315
  - 5.3 Trans-subjective Grouphood and the Prohibition of Genocide ..... 318
  - References ..... 320

- 6 Genocide and Impossible Attempts: Transcending Acoustic Separation** ..... 333
  - 6.1 The Law of Attempts *qua* Crucible ..... 333
  - 6.2 Inverted Mistake of Fact: The Subjectivist Approach ..... 335
  - 6.3 Penological Considerations ..... 337
  - 6.4 Attempt and the Law on Genocide ..... 338
    - 6.4.1 Commencement d’exécution ..... 340
    - 6.4.2 A Substantial Step ..... 347
    - 6.4.3 A Possible Interpretation of Article 25(3)(f) of the RS ..... 350
  - 6.5 Inverted Mistake of Fact: *Redux* ..... 353
  - 6.6 An Impossible Attempt to Commit Genocide ..... 355
    - 6.6.1 Impossibility and Inverted Mistake of Fact in Genocide ..... 357
    - 6.6.2 The Place of the Protected Legal Interest ..... 359
    - 6.6.3 Punishability and Legal Classification ..... 360
  - References ..... 366
  
- 7 Reconciling the Social and the Legal: Genocide as a Process** ..... 375
  - 7.1 Legal and Non-legal Accounts ..... 375
  - 7.2 The Perpetrator and the *Iter Criminis* ..... 379
  - 7.3 The Criminological Pathway of Genocide ..... 380
    - 7.3.1 Targeting ..... 382
    - 7.3.2 Othering ..... 386
    - 7.3.3 Re-interpretation of Collective Identities ..... 389
  - 7.4 Rules of Participation ..... 395
  - 7.5 Vulnerability ..... 396
    - 7.5.1 Normative and Historical Blueprints ..... 397
    - 7.5.2 Contesting Lemkin’s Exegesis ..... 403
    - 7.5.3 Potentiality and Vulnerability ..... 408
    - 7.5.4 The Particular Vulnerability of the Four Groups ..... 411
  - References ..... 417
  
- 8 The Contextual Element and the Inchoate Offenses of Genocide** ..... 431
  - 8.1 Collective and Individual Levels of Perpetration ..... 431
  - 8.2 A Contextual Element for Genocide ..... 434
  - 8.3 The Legal Nature of the Elements of Crimes Under the Rome Statute ..... 436
  - 8.4 The Elements of Crimes and Customary International Law ..... 438
  - 8.5 Genocide, Context, and the Structure of Endangerment ..... 443
    - 8.5.1 The Element of Endangerment in Criminal Law ..... 443
    - 8.5.2 The Structure of Endangerment and the Birth of the Concept of Genocide ..... 445

- 8.5.3 Genocide and Risk ..... 448
- 8.5.4 The Protective Scope of the Penal Norm ..... 450
- 8.5.5 Risk and the System of the Genocide Convention ..... 454
- 8.6 The Inchoate Offenses (Incitement and Conspiracy)
  - of Genocide and the Structure of Endangerment ..... 456
  - 8.6.1 Incitement during the Drafting of the Genocide
    - Convention ..... 456
  - 8.6.2 The Modern Law of Direct and Public Incitement ..... 458
  - 8.6.3 The Mens Rea of Incitement and the Structure
    - of Endangerment ..... 460
  - 8.6.4 Conspiracy, Incitement, and the Nuances of Risk ..... 463
- References ..... 466
- 9 The Structure of Endangerment in the *Actus Reus* of Genocide** .... 479
  - 9.1 The Many Faces of the Contextual Element ..... 479
  - 9.2 The Legal Geography of the Contextual Element ..... 483
  - 9.3 The Nuances of Risk: Conduct and Result-Based Acts
    - of Genocide ..... 488
  - 9.4 The Special Case of Causing Serious Bodily or Mental Harm ... 490
    - 9.4.1 Mental Harm in Genocide: Restrictive Approaches
      - and the Travaux ..... 493
    - 9.4.2 Mental Harm as a Result-Based Act: ‘Stealing’
      - the Victim from the Group ..... 500
  - 9.5 Individual Harm and Collective Risk ..... 502
  - 9.6 Substantiality, the *Actus Reus*, and Destruction in Part ..... 505
  - References ..... 517
- 10 A Realistic Genocidal Intent** ..... 525
  - 10.1 The Importance of Genocidal Intent ..... 525
  - 10.2 Realistic Intent and Endangerment ..... 529
    - 10.2.1 The *Ad hoc* Tribunals’ Engagement with the Intent
      - to Destroy ..... 533
    - 10.2.2 The Various Levels of a Genocidal Campaign ..... 540
    - 10.2.3 The Alleged Irrelevance of the Genocidal Context ..... 544
  - 10.3 De-contextualizing Genocide: Acoustic Separation
    - and Hate Crimes ..... 546
  - 10.4 A Realistic Intent ..... 550
    - 10.4.1 The Purpose-Based Approach ..... 555
    - 10.4.2 The Knowledge-Based Approach ..... 573
  - References ..... 584



**11 A Desire-Based and Knowledge-Inclusive Interpretation of Genocidal Intent** ..... 595

11.1 Motives During the Drafting of the Genocide Convention ..... 595

    11.1.1 The *Ad Hoc* Committee: Intent as Motive ..... 598

    11.1.2 Suppressing Motives(?): The Sixth Committee ..... 600

11.2 A Place for Motives in the *Gesamttat* and the *Einzeltat* ..... 604

11.3 Desire and the Intent to Destroy ..... 607

    11.3.1 Desiring Genocide’s Ulterior Goal ..... 608

    11.3.2 ‘Foot Soldiers’ of Genocide and a Desire-Based Intent to Destroy ..... 612

    11.3.3 Reasons for Adopting a Desired-Based and Knowledge-Inclusive Interpretation ..... 617

11.4 The Relativity of the ‘Inscrutability’ of Motives ..... 622

References ..... 626

**12 Conclusions** ..... 633

12.1 A Collective Right to Exist ..... 634

12.2 The Four Groups and Grouphood ..... 637

12.3 The Law of Attempts and Genocide ..... 639

12.4 The Criminal Trajectory of Genocide ..... 640

12.5 Collective Vulnerability and Situational Non-dominance ..... 643

12.6 An Endangerment Crime with a Desire-Based and Knowledge-Inclusive *Mens Rea* ..... 645

12.7 Final Remarks ..... 648

References ..... 649

**Table of Cases** ..... 651

**Index** ..... 665